

ALLEN v. USA

MICHAEL LEVY, M.D.
2/24/2006

Page 1

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

2 FOR THE DISTRICT OF ALASKA Hand Delivered

3 **RECEIVED**

MAR 13 2006

ASHBURN & MASON

COPY

4 KIMBERLY ALLEN, Personal)
Representative of the ESTATE)
5 OF TODD ALLEN, Individually,)
on Behalf of the ESTATE OF)
6 TODD ALLEN, and on Behalf of)
the Minor Child PRESLEY)
7 GRACE ALLEN,)

8 Plaintiffs,)

9 vs.)

10 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,)

11 Defendant.)

12 Case No. A04-0131 (JKS)
13

14 VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF MICHAEL LEVY, MD
15

16 Pages 1 - 195, inclusive
17

18 Friday, February 24, 2006
19 2:12 P.M.

20 Taken by Counsel for Plaintiffs
at
21 ASHBURN & MASON
1130 West 6th Avenue, Suite 100
22 Anchorage, Alaska
23
24
25

ALLEN v. USA

MICHAEL LEVY, M.D.
2/24/2006

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 36</p> <p>1 Q. Okay. And is that something that's written 2 about in the literature, that is, subarachnoid 3 hemorrhages being sort of misdiagnosed? 4 A. We've all -- it's -- it's a point of great 5 concern for all emergency physicians that we might 6 miss that. 7 Q. Okay. And why is that a point of great 8 concern? 9 A. Because it's an easy diagnosis to miss. 10 Q. Okay. And why do you say that? 11 A. Headaches are very common. 12 Q. Okay. So headaches are very common and -- 13 well, subarachnoid hemorrhage, is -- is that 14 something that could be potentially fatal? 15 A. Sure. Yes, it is. 16 Q. And be fair to say that a small number of 17 people who present with headaches actually have a 18 subar- -- subarachnoid hemorrhage. Is that right? 19 A. Yes. 20 Q. Okay. But is it -- is there a 21 statistically significant number of patients who 22 present with headache that actually do have a 23 subarachnoid hemorrhage? 24 A. Yes. 25 MR. GUARINO: I guess I'm not sure what you</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 38</p> <p>1 A. Yes. 2 Q. All right. And is that -- is that 3 something that you have seen written about in the 4 literature? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. Is that something that you actually 7 train -- when you're actually training your 8 emergency room physicians or -- or personnel, is 9 that -- is that something that you have actually 10 discussed with them, that is, the diagnosis of 11 subarachnoid hemorrhage? 12 A. Yes. 13 Q. Okay. And what do you generally -- in -- 14 in your training of other physicians or care 15 providers who are working in the emergency room, 16 what -- what, in fact, do you train them -- or how 17 do you train them in terms of making the diagnosis 18 or suspect the diagnosis of a subarachnoid 19 hemorrhage? 20 A. Well, the first thing is to always be 21 vigilant, that it could be something different. It 22 could be a subarachnoid hemorrhage, if they have a 23 headache. 24 Q. Okay. 25 A. So we want to look for a change in the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 37</p> <p>1 mean by "statistically significant." That -- that has 2 no -- has no legal meaning. It's not defined. I 3 mean -- 4 MS. MCCREADY: Well, did you under- -- 5 MR. GUARINO: -- does that mean one percent 6 is enough? Is -- is a half of one percent enough? 7 Is -- 8 MS. MCCREADY: Well, that's not my question. 9 Q. Did you understand my question? 10 A. I guess I didn't. I thought -- well, you 11 asked me whether some people have that, and I don't 12 think that's what you were asking me about. 13 Q. Okay. Well, is it -- is it -- are there 14 enough people who present with headaches who have a 15 subarachnoid hemorrhage -- is that -- is that number 16 great enough that it's of concern to emergency room 17 physicians? 18 A. Any potential disease process that we would 19 have the opportunity to diagnose and the opportunity 20 to miss is a concern to us. 21 Q. Okay. But specifically with subarachnoid 22 hemorrhages, I mean, is that something that's been a 23 concern within the emergency medical profession 24 for -- is it fair to say a few decades: They might 25 miss that diagnosis?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 39</p> <p>1 quality or nature of pain, pain that's more severe 2 than what may have been experienced by the person in 3 the past, the classic worst headache of one's life. 4 Q. And to do that, would you need to take a 5 care- -- careful history of the patient? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. And do you consider that to be the standard 8 of care, that is, that you would take a careful 9 history of a patient who presented with a headache? 10 A. The -- well, with any patient, we want to 11 have sufficient information from them so we can make 12 a diagnosis. 13 Q. Okay. So for any patient, would you agree 14 that the standard of care is to take a care- -- 15 careful history so that you can make a diagnosis of 16 the patient? 17 A. Yes. We always wants to be careful. I 18 mean, that's -- and I guess it just depends. One -- 19 start splitting hairs in terms of how much one has 20 to dress something up to call it a careful history, 21 perhaps -- 22 Q. Sure. 23 A. -- because in any given situation, a 24 careful history could be a couple words. 25 Q. Okay. But -- but a -- fair enough. But at</p>

12 (Pages 36 to 39)

ALLEN v. USA

MICHAEL LEVY, M.D.
2/24/2006

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 40</p> <p>1 least with a patient presenting with a headache, you</p> <p>2 would want to understand the -- the quality of the</p> <p>3 pain?</p> <p>4 A. Yes.</p> <p>5 Q. And the -- the quality and nature of the</p> <p>6 pain, I think you said. Is that correct?</p> <p>7 A. Yes.</p> <p>8 Q. And whether or not the pain was more severe</p> <p>9 than pain they've had before?</p> <p>10 A. Yes.</p> <p>11 Q. All right. And whether or not, as you</p> <p>12 said, it could be the worst headache of their life.</p> <p>13 Is that right?</p> <p>14 A. Yes.</p> <p>15 Q. And how about the -- would the location of</p> <p>16 the pain make any difference?</p> <p>17 A. The location of the pain I don't believe</p> <p>18 makes a difference per se.</p> <p>19 Q. Okay.</p> <p>20 A. Although if it has changed from their</p> <p>21 typical pain, I'll say, then that would be something</p> <p>22 a person might want to note.</p> <p>23 Q. Okay. And how about the onset of pain?</p> <p>24 Would that be important?</p> <p>25 A. Yes.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 42</p> <p>1 A. So I might not say, was it abrupt, was it</p> <p>2 sudden in onset. It'd be sufficient for me if they</p> <p>3 said, "This is what I've had before."</p> <p>4 Q. Okay. And -- and let me ask you if you --</p> <p>5 you've dealt with patients who have chronic pain, I</p> <p>6 assume --</p> <p>7 A. Oh, yes.</p> <p>8 Q. -- working in the emergency room?</p> <p>9 A. Yes.</p> <p>10 Q. Okay. And would the -- is the standard of</p> <p>11 care different for a patient who has got chronic</p> <p>12 pain, in terms of taking a history, whether or not</p> <p>13 that's important?</p> <p>14 A. The -- is the standard of care different?</p> <p>15 The approach to the patient is similar, but it's</p> <p>16 usually more focused, because typically the patient</p> <p>17 has had many prior experiences with the emergency</p> <p>18 department, with the health care system. And so</p> <p>19 quite honestly one can pretty much move forward and</p> <p>20 ask if anything has changed or if we're just dealing</p> <p>21 with the same thing. If they have other concerns,</p> <p>22 what -- what their main concern for being in the</p> <p>23 emergency department is on that day.</p> <p>24 Q. Sure. If you've got a patient that</p> <p>25 presents at the emergency room with chronic pain, is</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 41</p> <p>1 Q. All right. And why would that be</p> <p>2 important?</p> <p>3 A. The -- a more abrupt onset of pain may mean</p> <p>4 something a little different than pain that starts</p> <p>5 more gradually.</p> <p>6 Q. Okay.</p> <p>7 A. There are exertional headaches, for</p> <p>8 example, thunderclap headaches associated with</p> <p>9 sexual activity, those kind of things.</p> <p>10 Q. Would you want to know what the patient was</p> <p>11 doing when the pain began, in addition to the --</p> <p>12 whether or not it was abrupt?</p> <p>13 A. If the patient stated that they had an</p> <p>14 abrupt onset of headache, then you might ask what</p> <p>15 they were doing when it started.</p> <p>16 Q. Okay. But would that be something if -- if</p> <p>17 a patient -- in your practice, if the patient</p> <p>18 presents with a headache, do you ask them what the</p> <p>19 onset was and whether or not it was abrupt?</p> <p>20 A. Yes.</p> <p>21 Q. Okay.</p> <p>22 A. What I might say more typically was: Is</p> <p>23 this one of your typical headaches? Was there</p> <p>24 anything unusual about the headache?</p> <p>25 Q. Sure.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 43</p> <p>1 one of the first things that you want to know</p> <p>2 whether or not they're there to get pain medication?</p> <p>3 A. Well, that's always in there somewhere,</p> <p>4 isn't it? But the issue really is: What is it</p> <p>5 today that makes you want to come to the emergency</p> <p>6 department? If the issue is pain medication, sure,</p> <p>7 be upfront and say it. If it's something else, let</p> <p>8 me know, so I can figure out what it is.</p> <p>9 Q. Okay. But you would want to know, with a</p> <p>10 chronic pain patient, whether or not -- if they're</p> <p>11 presenting with pain, whether or not that pain is</p> <p>12 different than what they've before?</p> <p>13 A. Yes.</p> <p>14 Q. All right. Well, let me ask this: If</p> <p>15 someone said, you know what, it's really not that</p> <p>16 important to take a history of the patient who</p> <p>17 presents in the emergency department with chronic</p> <p>18 pain, would you agree with that?</p> <p>19 A. No.</p> <p>20 Q. Would you agree that one of the primary</p> <p>21 functions of the emergency department in a hospital</p> <p>22 is to determine if a patient has a condition that's</p> <p>23 serious, treatable and urgent?</p> <p>24 A. Yes.</p> <p>25 Q. Okay. And would you agree that one of the</p>

13 (Pages 40 to 43)